

# Polemic Discourse on the Zoning Education System Policy by the Ministry of Education and Culture in Bondowoso Indonesia

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.47175/rielsj.v4i2.724>

| Widya Oryzani<sup>1,\*</sup> | Anang Santoso<sup>2</sup> | Gatut Susanto<sup>3</sup> |

<sup>1,2,3</sup> Master of Indonesia  
Language Education,  
University of Malang, Malang,  
East Java, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup>[widyaoryzani@gmail.com](mailto:widyaoryzani@gmail.com)

<sup>2</sup>[anang.santoso.fs@um.ac.id](mailto:anang.santoso.fs@um.ac.id)

<sup>3</sup>[gatut.susanto.fs@um.ac.id](mailto:gatut.susanto.fs@um.ac.id)

## ABSTRACT

*This study aims to describe the polemic over the zoning education system policy in the Bondowoso region. The method used is qualitative research with the type of critical discourse analysis research and the Fairclough critical discourse analysis model. The data in this study are in the form of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences related to the text and the results of the interviews which show polemics. Sources of data for this research were taken from Ministry of Education and Culture Regulations, follow-up policies from the Education Office, interview results, and online media documentation. The instruments used in data collection were the researchers themselves who acted as key instruments, devices, recording devices, note sheets, and laptops. Data collection techniques in this study were carried out using documentation, interviews and observation techniques. Data analysis techniques, researchers used critical discourse analysis developed by Fairclough by way of description, interpretation and explanation. The results of the study show the use of lingual features such as lexical processes, euphemisms, transitivity, and modality, as well as the ideology of each group involved. The polemic found from each group with the existence of a zoning education system policy can be used as literacy material and also for consideration in making further policies.*

## KEYWORDS

*critical discourse analysis; zoning education system policy polemics; lingual features; ideology*

## INTRODUCTION

Education is one of the important sectors in the country and is an alternative for every individual to contribute to the country. Education is an opportunity to develop the potential, talents and interests needed in everyday life and in the future. In general, education is divided into two, namely academic and non-academic which can be taken through formal and non-formal education. Education from the surrounding environment is usually free and indirect, while formal education must follow the system and applicable rules. In formal education, the education system or policy imposed by the government for each education unit aims to increase access and expand learning opportunities for all levels and improve the quality of education.

One of the government's efforts to produce quality education is to make a zoning education system policy. The zoning system is a new student admission system (PPDB) by determining the radius of the nearest zone with a certain percentage of the number of students who will be accepted. This zoning system has been in effect since 2017 until now and is

applied at all levels of education (SD, SMP, SMA/SMK). One of the areas that implements the zoning system is Bondowoso district.

Bondowoso is one of the districts in East Java. The implementation of the zoning system policy in Bondowoso reaped the pros and cons. After conducting random research, several schools in Bondowoso assessed that the zoning policy was actually detrimental, but on the other hand there were also schools that benefited. These pros and cons have been going on since the beginning of the enactment of the zoning system policy until now. The data provided shows that there has not been a significant increase, especially in the distribution of students.

Previous research on the zoning system has focused on several educational perspectives. In 2019, Gunarti Ika and Rukiyati conducted a study on zoning that focused on the education management of the schools studied. In the same year, Ida Ayu, et al, also researched zoning which focused on parents' perceptions of the zoning system. In 2021, Devinta and Turban will also conduct research on the zoning system. Their research focuses on the impact on learners received from the zoning system. The similarity from previous research is the use of qualitative methods and the chosen topic is zoning. The difference lies in the formulation of the problem and the theory used.

This study aims to describe the zoning system policy from a different focus. The difference in research focus also aims to obtain results that are more transparent and not to corner any party. This study examines the zoning policies of the various parties involved. The intended parties are those who make policies and implement policies. In this case, it will be divided into pro, con, and neutral parties. The surgery will be carried out based on three dimensions in the critical discourse analysis initiated by Fairclough. The three dimensions include text, discourse practice, and sociocultural practice.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### ***Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis***

Critical discourse analysis elaborates and explains the relationship between the two scopes of study, including local and global intersections, as well as discourse structures and societal structures. According to Fairclough, AWK must pay attention to its three dimensions: text, discursive practice, and social praxis. Text analysis consists of vocabulary, grammatical, and text structure. Text analysis is usually carried out to find out the hidden ideology and power contained in it. Second, analysis of discursive or discursive practice. Texts usually involve complex and complex discourse practices. Through discourse analysis, there is a process of linking the production and consumption of texts that is focused on the way the author or writers take the existing discourse by paying attention to how power relations are played. An analysis of discursive practice that includes, first, the extent to which the power of the statement is able to induce action. Second, the coherence of the texts that have been interpreted. Third, the problem of text intertextuality, namely the presence of elements from other texts in a text which can be in the form of quotes, references, or contents. Third, social praxis by explaining the relation of heterogeneous textual features along with the complexity of the discourse process with the process of sociocultural change. An analysis of sociocultural praxis which is based on the fact that the social context outside the media influences how discourse appears in the media. The purpose of the analysis of socio-cultural praxis is to portray discourse as part of a social process, as a social praxis that shows how discourse is determined by what social and reproductive structures can influence discourse that cumulatively uses, sustains, or changes these structures (Fairclough in Santoso, 2020: 134).

## **RESEARCH METHODS**

This study uses a qualitative approach design with the type of critical discourse analysis research. This study uses the critical discourse analysis model developed by Fairclough. The analysis begins with text analysis through lingual features. Text analysis is divided into two; 1) Analysis of vocabulary usage; and 2) Analysis of grammatical usage. Researchers will describe and identify the use of certain lingual features that refer to certain actions. The data in this study were the text of the Minister of Education and Culture, the continued policy of the education office, the results of interviews with the principals of superior and non-superior schools, the results of interviews with subject teachers, the results of interviews with parents of students. Data collection was carried out using documentation, interviews and observation techniques. Documentation is used to obtain education zoning policy data through the Permendikbud, follow-up policies from the Education Office, and related news quotes. Interviews were used to obtain complex data and to determine the validity of the data between the data in the text and the data found in the field. Interview data were obtained through favorite and non-favorite school principals, subject teachers, and student guardians. While data collection through observation is used to obtain supporting data. The instruments used in the research were interview sheets, gadgets, laptops and notepads. Researchers will group the data collected according to the type of use of the lingual features found. Researchers will pay attention to the use of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences. The data analysis phase used Fairclough's critical discourse analysis tools.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

This section will discuss the results of the research, namely 1) the results of the analysis of vocabulary use, 2) the results of the analysis of grammatical use, and 3) the ideology of each group as follows.

### ***Vocabulary Usage Analysis Results***

The use of lingual features through the use of vocabulary found in this study includes lexical processes and euphemistic expressions. Lexical processes are processes that occur in vocabulary as a reflection and expression of group or community interests. The lexical process includes several things including classification patterns and ideological words that are fought for. Classification patterns relate to certain vocabulary choices that are used to classify certain realities. The ideological words that are fought for are the study of the words that are attempted to be instilled in the minds of the target community.

- (1) "Local governments are required to make regional policies as a follow-up to this Ministerial Regulation on the principles of objectivity, transparency, accountability, non-discrimination and fairness."

Text creators also use words that refer to the shape of the lingual features. The prominent lingual feature is the existence of vocabulary that is fought for, such as "objectivity", "transparency", and "fairness". Each of these words has a different meaning. Objectivity means being honest and not being influenced by personal or other group opinions or considerations. Transparency means doing it openly. Justice means not prioritizing any party. Based on the findings of the lingual features in data (4) it shows that text makers want to be seen as a fair and neutral party in making policies.

The use of vocabulary found is the use of euphemistic expressions. In political discourse, euphemistic expressions are often misused to cover up deficiencies. This study found several uses of euphemistic expressions to soften a situation.

(2) "Schools which, based on the results of the selection, have a number of prospective students exceeding their capacity, are required to report the excess of these prospective students to the education office in accordance with their authority."

In data (2), the sentence "schools based on the results of the selection have a number of prospective students that exceeds their capacity capacity". The use of these sentences to describe prospective students who do not pass the selection. Instead of using the word "disadvantage", the author of the text actually uses the word "advantage" to describe the vocabulary with negative connotations.

### **Results of Grammatical Usage Analysis**

The use of lingual features through grammatical use found in this study includes transitivity and modality. Transitivity is a set of universal categories that characterize different types of events and processes, different types of participants in certain events, and various conditions of place and time in which events occur. Halliday argues that there are three kinds of transitivity including; (1) action processes: actions, events, and behavior; (2) mental processes: perception, affection, and cognition; and (3) relational processes: attributive, identification, and existential (1985; 1994). The transitivity is shown in the following table.

No	Initial Name	∑ Process Analyzed	∑ Material Process (%)	∑ Mental Process (%)	∑ Relation Process (%)
1	<b>KPK</b>	65	33 (50,7)*	11 (17)*	21 (32,3)
2	<b>MBO</b>	16	6 (37,5)*	7 (43,8)*	3 (18,7)
3	<b>DP</b>	21	3 (14,3)	13 (61,9)*	5 (23,8)*
4	<b>SU</b>	33	7 (21,2)*	23 (69,7)*	3 (9,1)
5	<b>SNU</b>	16	3 (18,8)*	12 (75)*	1 (6,2)

The table above shows that the clauses produced by each group of education system policy implementers have different tendencies. Based on the table above, the transitive system analysis provides an overview of the tendency of each group to be dominated by material processes and mental processes. The implementers of the zoning system policy prioritize actions and affection. From the data obtained, it has been found that there are 151 clauses as transitive processes. The transitive process is indicated by a description of each process, namely material processes (52 clauses), mental processes (66 clauses), relational processes (33 clauses).

Modality is a lingual feature that indicates the speaker's level of commitment to the spoken proposition. One type of modality is deontic modality. Deontic modality is used to express commands, permissions, and prohibitions.

(1) "The closest zone radius as referred to in paragraph (1) is determined by the regional government in accordance with the conditions in the area based on the total availability of capacity based on the provisions of study groups for each school with the availability of school-age children in the area."

In data (1) the use of the phrase "determined by the local government" indicates that the creator of the text authorizes another party to set a policy. The other party in question is the local government. The authority given is followed by another statement. The statement is described in the clause "according to the provisions" with the intention that it is in accordance with the rules determined by the creator of the text. Based on this, that can be

seen that the maker of the text is the highest policy maker and allows local governments to set regulations in the regions.

### ***The Ideology of the Zoning System Policy Implementation Group***

Each group implementing the zoning system policy has a different ideology. Based on the results of text analysis through the use of vocabulary and grammatical use, ideological results from each group were found. Groups are divided into pro, contra, and neutral groups. However, previously the Ministry of Education and Culture as a policy maker also had an ideology, namely "the highest authority in every policy". In every article of the Minister of Education and Culture, it is almost written the words "must", "mandatory", "according to policy", etc. The vocabulary can be found in the following data.

- (1) "Schools run by the regional government are required to accept prospective students who live in the closest radius zone of the school at least 90% (ninety percent) of the total number of students accepted."

Based on data 2, the author of the text uses the word "obligatory". Reporting from KBBI, the meaning of the word "mandatory" is to be done. This shows that the author of the text ordered schools to follow the rules that had been given. The assertion from the author of the text is supported by the sentence after it. The sentence "at least 90% of the total number of students accepted" indicates that the rules have been made. The text generator has included numbers which means there are specific instructions clearly given.

The next ideology is the ideology of "following every superior's rules". This ideology is the ideology of the pro group. The data taken from the pro group shows that the group fully supports the zoning system policy made by the Ministry of Education and Culture. This ideology can be seen in the following data.

- (2) "We still refer to the regulations from the Ministry of Education and Culture but adapted to the conditions of the Bondowoso area."

The clause above contains the ideology of the speaker as a group that is pro towards the policy regarding the zoning system. The ideology can be seen from the verb used, namely referring. These verbs show that speakers follow the rules made by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Even though the speaker says that he is still adjusting to the conditions in his area, the speaker emphasizes his actions by using the phrase still refers.

The ideology of the contra group contains the ideology of "feeling disadvantaged and not prioritizing their needs". After conducting interviews and data transcription, this ideology was found. Contra groups continuously provide answers that lead to disappointment with the zoning system policy. This can be seen in the following data.

- (3) "The change is very detrimental for SMPN 6 Bondowoso."

Phrases in bold are examples of phrases that contain the ideology of the speaker. It can be seen that the cons group really disappointed with the zoning system. The contra group not only stated it with the verb harmful, but they also added the verb very. This shows that the contra groups no longer agree with the zoning system policy because it is considered not profitable for them.

The last ideology is the ideology of "messaging between policy implementers". If you look at the headlines made by the neutral group, it does tend to side with the counter group. However, if you read the contents of the writing, you can see that this group is trying to mediate between the pro and contra groups. They tend to include the opinions of each group.



## CONCLUSION

The zoning education system policy is a policy made by the Ministry of Education and Culture. The policy is regulated in the Minister of Education and Culture regarding PPDB. The zoning system regulates one of the pathways for accepting new students by determining the closest zone radius. This policy has been in place since 2017 until now and has undergone several changes. This policy sparked a polemic in the Bondowoso area. The polemic in the zoning education system policy by the Ministry of Education and Culture in the Bondowoso area is analyzed using the normal Fairclough critical discourse analysis. The analysis focuses on the lingual features and the ideology of each group involved. The results obtained proved to be able to show the interests of each group, giving rise to polemics. Based on this paper, the author is open to all forms of input and constructive criticism. The author hopes that there will be more researchers who are interested in studying government policies using Fairclough's critical discourse analysis. So that they can contribute to each other's literacy from a critical perspective.

## REFERENCES

- Amalia, A & Syukron, A. A. (2020). Analisis Wacana Kritis Norman Fairclough Pada Pemberitaan Demo Mahasiswa Tolak Revisi RKUHP dan UU KPK Di Kompas Tv. *Logat: Jurnal Bahasa Indonesia dan Pembelajaran*, 7(1), 43-58.
- Amalia, D. N & Yani, M. T. (2021). Upaya Guru Dalam Menangani Karakter Siswa Yang Heterogen Sebagai Dampak Sistem Zonasi Di SMPN 5 Gresik. *Kajian Moral dan Kewarganegaraan*, 9(1), 91-108.
- Arlin, A. (2018). Representasi Kekuasaan Dalam Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia SMA Kelas XI Kurikulum 2013 (Analisis Wacana Kritis Fairclough). *Indonesian Journal of Fundamental Sciences*, 4(1), 45-53.
- Pradewi, G. I., & Rukiyati, R. (2019). Kebijakan sistem zonasi dalam perspektif pendidikan. *JMSP (Jurnal Manajemen dan Supervisi Pendidikan)*, 4(1), 28-34.
- Santoso, Anang. (2011). Bahasa Perempuan: Sebuah Potret Ideologi Perjuangan. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Santoso, Anang. (2020). Studi Bahasa Kritis: Menguak Bahasa Membongkar Kuasa. Bandung: CV. Mandar Maju.
- Umar, F.A. (2011). Sumbangan Analisis Wacana Terhadap Pembelajaran Bahasa dan Sastra. *Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, dan Budaya*, 1(1), 37-46